

# 博士學位論文審査要旨

2019年1月17日

論文題目：“But Our Citizenship Is in Heaven”: Making Christianity “Japanese” and Transnational, 1895-1945

「我らの国籍は天にあり」―「日本の」キリスト教と国境を超えたキリスト教―1895-1945

学位申請者：池端千賀子

審査委員：

主査：グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 教授 Gavin James Campbell

副査：グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 准教授 Fanon Che Wilkins

副査：同志社大学 名誉教授 細谷 正宏

要 旨：

This dissertation, submitted by Ikehata Chikako, is a sophisticated, deeply-researched examination of how three Japanese Free Methodists demonstrate the complex relationship of religious and national identity in the period from 1895-1945. By examining these three figures in close detail, she upends standard understandings about the relationship between Christianity and Japanese identity, between missionary and convert, and the religious relationship between the US and Japan. This dissertation therefore makes important contributions to several important historiographical trends in missionary studies and transnational American Studies.

The first chapter examines the career of the Free Methodist pioneer Kakihara Masaji, exploring his conversion to Christianity, his travels to the United States and his subsequent missionary career in Japan. She points out that Kakihara began a process that scholars have often called “indigenization,” whereby converts rework the Christian message to fit within the convert’s local context and frames of reference. Yet, as she shows throughout, this did not break down ties between Americans and Japanese Free Methodists, but instead opened a pathway for building a relationship outside the bonds of nation.

The second chapter examines the work of Kawabe Teikichi, who took over from Kakihara the major responsibility for promoting Free Methodism in Japan. But more than simply a Christian laborer in Japan, Kawabe, as Ikehata effectively shows, saw himself in equal communion with Christians in America, and used his time in the US to not only evangelize members of the Japanese immigrant community, but any Americans with whom he came into contact. Through these activities, Ikehata demonstrates how Kawabe built bridges that transcended national identity, using religion to forge a transnational fellowship that extended the foundations laid in Kakihara’s ministry. Ikehata also shows that the claims of

religious transnational fellowship often overcame narrow national interests, allowing Kakiyama and his American counterparts to see themselves in a relatively equal partnership.

The third and final chapter examines the morally complex and ambiguous work of another major figure in Japanese Free Methodism: Tsuchiyama Tetsuji. Whereas most scholarship assumes that missionaries are westerners sent “east,” Tsuchiyama is a fascinating case study of a Japanese Christian who went to China as a missionary, working with fellow Chinese Christians during the Japanese imperial occupation. This proved enormously sensitive, since naturally Chinese Christians were extremely cautious about working with anyone tied to Japan. Tsuchiyama’s willingness to work with Imperial Japanese forces to advance the “pacification” goals of the imperial state further amplified these fears. This chapter, then, examines carefully the moral ambiguities and strains placed on transnational Christian fellowship and identity during a period of political and military conflict. It demonstrates that the ability of religious fellowship to break down national hostilities sometimes faltered in periods of intense national conflict.

Altogether this is an extremely well researched and carefully articulated dissertation. It tackles major issues of religious and national identity, and does so with a full command of relevant primary and secondary materials. The committee encouraged her to pursue publishing the dissertation as a book, and at that point to take a wider scope, to see beyond the perspectives of her major subjects and find corroborating or conflicting material that will add further complexity. The committee also suggested developing the historical context, to better integrate larger trends in missiology and in global Christianity, which would strengthen the argument considerably.

In sum, the committee unanimously agreed that the dissertation is a fine work of mature scholarship, and that it fully deserves recognition as a contribution to missionary studies and transnational American Studies, and that it amply meets all the requirements for a PhD dissertation.

よって、本論文は、博士（アメリカ研究）（同志社大学）の学位を授与するにふさわしいものであると認められる。

## 総合試験結果の要旨

2019年1月17日

論文題目：“But Our Citizenship Is in Heaven”: Making Christianity “Japanese” and Transnational, 1895-1945

「我らの国籍は天にあり」―「日本の」キリスト教と国境を超えたキリスト教―1895-1945

学位申請者： 池端千賀子

審査委員：

主査： グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 教授 Gavin James Campbell

副査： グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 准教授 Fanon Che Wilkins

副査： 同志社大学 名誉教授 細谷 正宏

要 旨：

学位申請者である池端千賀子氏に対する総合試験を2018年12月20日10時から11時30分まで、同志社大学志高館SK117にて実施した。前半の30分は申請者の発表、後半の1時間を質疑応答にあてた。学位申請者は、本論文の問題意識、課題と方法、具体的な分析内容を各章丁寧に説明し、審査委員からの質問に対して的確かつ誠実に答え、本研究の学術的意義と今後の発展の可能性について説得的に述べた。

本論文主要部分は、査読付きの学術雑誌ですでに複数発表されており、また関連しての国内外の学術報告が存在する。こうした研究業績との関連についても、質問がされ、申請者から明確な応答があった。また研究遂行上必要とされる英語能力も、論文作成・発表・質疑応答が英語で行われたことをもって、十分であることが確認された。よって、審査委員一同、総合試験の結果は合格であると認める。

## 博士學位論文要旨

論文題目： “But Our Citizenship Is in Heaven”: Making Christianity “Japanese” and Transnational, 1895-1945

(「我らの国籍は天にあり」—「日本の」キリスト教と国境を超えたキリスト教—1895-1945)

氏名： 池端千賀子

要旨：

Tracing the missionary activities of three Japanese Free Methodist leaders -- Kakihara Masaji, Kawabe Teikichi, and Tsuchiyama Tetsuji -- this study explores the intersection between national citizenship and religious membership. As both the U.S. and Japan consolidated national identities as well as expanded in the Pacific, and as the Japanese imperial government increasingly tightened its control over the citizens, these three Christians navigated the competing borders of national (Japanese) citizenship and religious (Christian) membership and, by making Christianity “Japanese” and transnational, claimed a place for themselves both in Japanese society and in the larger transnational Christian community. Working with partners in Japan, the U.S., and China, they continually searched for their place as Japanese Christians, but in the context of Japanese imperial aggression, they faced new challenges. By pointing out the uncertain ground of national, cultural, and religious identity, this study suggests the possibilities and limitations of Christianity to create transnational community outside nation-state boundaries.

In three developing phases, this study explores Japanese Free Methodists’ attempts to make Christianity simultaneously “Japanese” and transnational, challenging assumptions that Christianity and Christian missionaries were “Western.” Chapter 1 focuses on Free Methodism’s first missionary in Japan, Kakihara Masaji, and narrates how he embraced Christianity, planted Free Methodism in Japan, and continued working as a missionary through strong connections with his American counterparts. This chapter argues that Kakihara demonstrated that missionaries and those with authority to speak were not always Euro-Americans. Kakihara believed native initiatives in bringing Free Methodism to Japan were simply following the Great Commission, but, through his mission efforts, Kakihara also demonstrated the ways Christianity called upon sources of identity outside the State. In this way, Kakihara helped extend the boundaries of religious identity.

Kawabe Teikichi further extended Christianity’s boundaries by launching a series of Pacific West Coast mission trips targeting not only the Japanese diaspora but also Americans he met along the way. In his evangelical work among Japanese immigrants, he showed that Christianity could help Japanese immigrant communities fight against racial and cultural discrimination and integrate them into the larger society. By rejecting a “Japanese” Christianity specifically tailored to Japanese immigrants, he implicitly argued for a universal Christian message that applied to believers of any nation or ethnicity. In so doing, he revealed a transnational aspect of Christianity. While he focused his evangelical work among Japanese immigrants, he did not confine his missionary career by race or nationality. Chapter 2 argues that, in his “reverse mission,” Kawabe demonstrated that Japanese spiritual leaders could transmit the Christian gospel to anyone including white Americans. Thus, Kawabe, as a transnational missionary,

redefined Christianity as a more pluralistic and inclusive religion.

Chapter 3 depicts Tsuchiyama Tetsuji's mission trips to wartime China, which represented an even further development of Japanese Christians' evangelical mission, while also exposing the limits of transnational religious connections. Tsuchiyama saw his evangelical work in wartime China as the best way to fulfill several ambitions: to consolidate the Japan Free Methodist Church, to win the trust of the Japanese government, and to promote Japanese evangelical missions abroad. His China trips seemed like a great opportunity for Japanese Christians to show their loyalty to both their government and their God. Working with American missionaries, he believed that the Japanese church could demonstrate its independence within the global Christian community. But working on behalf of both God and the government left him and Japanese missionaries vulnerable to criticism that they served the State rather than God. By prioritizing nation-state boundaries and imperial ambitions, his trips undermined Christian claims of global fellowship and equality and revealed the ambiguity of his religious identity. While Tsuchiyama, and other Japanese and even American Free Methodists, sometimes confined their faith within nation-state boundaries, he nevertheless believed in a shared heavenly citizenship and demonstrated a new phase in the maturity of Japanese Christianity which could reach out to evangelize beyond the US-Japan relationship.

By narrating the mission work of Kakiyama, Kawabe, and Tsuchiyama, this study demonstrates how they skillfully navigated competing national and religious borders and how they shared their spiritual power with non-Japanese Christians. By pointing out the uncertain ground of national, cultural, and religious identity, this study suggests Christianity's possibilities and limitations as a way of bringing people together across boundaries of politics and nation. In spite of all the difficulties, these Christians hoped to follow the central Christian teaching that their citizenship is in heaven, and that all souls are equal in God's sight.