

博士学位論文審査要旨

2013年1月24日

論文題目： Politicization of Religious and Cultural Identity in Kashmir Conflict
1989-2011: A Case Study of the Kashmir Minority Communities of Leh
(Ladakh)

カシミール紛争における宗教的・文化的アイデンティティの政治化
(1989年～2011年)ーラッダーク地方レイ市のカシミール少数派コミュニティを事例に

学位申請者： Philip Mathew (フィリップ・マッテユ)

審査委員：

主査： グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 教授 中西久枝

副査： グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 教授 峯 陽一

副査： グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 教授 小山田英治

要 旨：

カシミール問題は、インド・パキスタン独立以前から存在していたが、その定義と紛争の根本原因については、極度に政治的かつ戦略的な地域である理由から、研究者の見解が多様であり、かつ係争地の特定化が各国ごとに見解が分かれている。本研究では、カシミール紛争における宗教的、文化的アイデンティティの政治化を1989年から2011年までの時期に限定して論じている。特に、チベット系の仏教徒の住民が多く居住するラッダーク地方のレイ市での現地調査をもとに、1989年の戦闘的ムスリム組織のテロ活動が当該地域の紛争のエスカレーションにどう影響したかという観点から、アイデンティティの政治化現象をレイ市の宗教的、文化的に多様なコミュニティ間の関係性に焦点を合わせて論じた。本論文は、従来、カシミール問題が主としてインドとパキスタンの間の国家間の領土争いであると主張されてきたが、そうした研究動向を批判し、新たな観点からの研究の可能性を提示している。すなわち、「異なるエスニック集団や宗教的、文化的差異が大きい、コミュニティ間のアイデンティティをそれぞれの集団が政治的に利用することで、政治的、経済的資源や権益を極大化する傾向があること、またそれが紛争のエスカレーションにつながっていくこと」を実証している。本論文は、コミュニティ間の関係性を社会的ネットワークの観点から考察し、「社会関連資本」の理論を採用して、アイデンティティの政治化現象と紛争がエスカレーションに至るプロセスを分析している。

本論文は、6章から構成され、3回にわたる現地でのフィールド調査の結果であるインタビューの記録も補填資料として提示している。本論文の一部はすでにレフェリー制の雑誌論文として出版されている。本論文は、社会政治理論に基づき、また文化人類学的なアプローチも採用した学際性の高い論文となっており、扱った事例は、他の紛争分析にも援用可能な論点と視点を提示している。また、研究の実証性の高さから、一定のオリジナリティをもった論文となっている。以上の理由から、博士(グローバル社会研究)(同志社大学)の学位を授与するにふさわしいものであると認められる。

総合試験結果の要旨

2013年2月2日

論文題目 : Politicization of Religious and Cultural Identity in Kashmir Conflict
1989-2011: A Case Study of the Kashmir Minority Communities of Leh
(Ladakh)

カシミール紛争における宗教的・文化的アイデンティティの政治化
(1989年～2011年)ーラッダーク地方レイ市のカシミール少数派コミュニティを事例に

学位申請者: Philip Mathew (フィリップ・マッテュ)

審査委員:

主査: グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 教授 中西久枝
副査: グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 教授 峯 陽一
副査: グローバル・スタディーズ研究科 教授 小山田英治

要 旨:

申請者の Philip Mathew (フィリップ・マッテュ)氏は、2012年7月19日に実施された博士論文提出資格試験にすでに合格している。資格試験では、論文の概要について40分の発表があり、それに基づいて3名の審査委員が30分間質疑応答し、的確に答えることができた。その際、論文が英語で執筆されることから、発表と質疑応答はすべて英語で行うことで、英語の語学試験を兼ねて実施し、十分な英語の語学力を有するものと判断した。また、専門分野であるグローバル社会研究の、より広い領域についても口頭による諮問を行ったが、十分な知識を有することが審査員によって確認され、論文提出に必要な条件を満たしていると判定し、資格審査に合格した。その後、2012年11月30日に博士論文が提出された。それを受け、審査委員が教授会で選考され、3名の審査員による博士論文公開審査が2013年1月15日13時より14時半までに実施された。申請者による論文の概要について40分の発表があり、その後口述試験として論文、論文テーマに関連する専門分野に関する諮問を行い、博士(グローバル社会研究)の学位に値すると認められた。よって、総合試験の結果は合格であると認める。

博士學位論文要旨

論文題目 : Politicization of Religious and Cultural Identity in Kashmir Conflict 1989-2011: A Case Study of the Kashmir Minority Communities of Leh (Ladakh)

カシミール紛争における宗教的・文化的アイデンティティの政治化(1989年～2011年) — ラダーク地方レイ市のカシミール少数派コミュニティを事例に

氏名 : Philip Mathew (フィリップ・マッテユ)

要旨 :

Some proponents of the Global Civil Society have argued that the end of the Cold War and the subsequent fall of the political ideological walls have developed an environment in which the more grass-root level movements would provide social and civic space for local communities to engage with people within and among the communities. Other scholars have thought that the occurrence of conflicts and wars would decline with the end of the continued state of political and military tension between the Communist and Democratic blocks of nations in the Post-Cold War era.

However, recent conflicts in Central Africa, West Africa, Central Asia, as well as uprisings in the Arab Middle East have shown various characteristics of Post-Cold War conflicts. First, conflict is a wild process involving ethnic, linguistic, racial, and religious exclusion, and can become violent due to this nature of conflict. Second, owing to remittance from diaspora fund-raising, and foreign governmental assistance and the diversion of international humanitarian aid, socio-political and economic fragmentation, and diversity between and within the communities have progressed. Third, conflicts often manifest themselves through violence at varying scales and levels of intensity. Yet, conflicts also represent a continuum of non-violent economic, social, institutional, and political factors, and could be escalated into violence. Thus, social and economic grievances, as addressed by Azar, can be one of the significant root causes of some conflict. Fourth, both violent and nonviolent conflicts are often seen as important drivers of social change, can often pose a threat to global community and human existence as well.

In addition to the above-mentioned characteristics of conflicts in the post-Cold War period, there has been an alternative view for conflict resolution, a theory of conflict transformation. Rather than seeking direct conflict resolutions, this theory maintains that it is important to transform the nature and conflicting parties' interactions to avoid the intensification of the conflict. On the other hand, some authors such as Mary Kaldor argue that one of the root causes of the post-Cold War conflicts are identity based politics and the politicization of identities.

Mary Kaldor who is a pioneer in identity based approach to the conflict proposes that conflicts were political conflicts, involving state power as well as various 'private' forces, in which 'identity politics' is a means by which political elites reproduce their powers. Besides, Karina V Korostelina in one of her article called "Identity Conflict" maintains "social identities are neither sources nor results of conflict but as a form of consciousness that entirely changes the dynamic and structure of the conflict."

However, in the protracted conflicts such as Palestinian conflicts and Kashmir conflicts, previous studies have not discussed fully how identities are politicized and prolonged the conflicts. In this research, a hypothesis is that particularly minority communities have used identities and their demands in conflict have been politicized in the very fragmented socio-political and economic contexts. To prove this hypothesis, this research takes up the case of Kashmir conflict.

Kashmir has a geopolitical strategic significance for the three surrounding countries of India, Pakistan and China. They are, as a matter of fact, three nuclear powers of Asia. Consequently, the support for some degree of autonomy in some part of Kashmir or the suppression of such a movement by any one state can cause a serious impact on any one of the three countries and on the relationship of the other two countries. Besides, different religious communities, which compose the area called Kashmir, have often been politically and morally supported by their counterparts in the surrounding countries of India, Pakistan, and China. Such a nature of the support given to one community has created suspicion among the members of the other communities, causing a lack of trust among the members of the communities.

Among highly geopolitically fragmented areas generally called “Kashmir,” a region called Leh is chosen for the case study in this dissertation. Due to the geographically strategic position of Leh in Kashmir for the three surrounding countries of India, Pakistan and China, people’s demand for autonomy in Leh and the suppression of the autonomous movement by India’s government have made a serious impact not only on India and Pakistan, but also on Tibetan’s demand for autonomy in China.

In this research, how identity factors have affected the protraction of the conflict will be discussed in the Chapter1. Chapter 2 will discuss how the Kashmir historically developed a common identity from 14th to the 19th century. In chapter 3, the process in which the identity rift has occurred in Kashmir will be analyzed. In the chapter 4, and 5 how identities are used in the political and economic or social demand of minority communities in conflicts, and how identities have been politicized on the ground will be discussed. The following section will survey the main points in each chapter.

Chapter 1 deals with literature review and indicated poor governance, poverty, economic and political inequality, and the violation of human rights in the context of India-Pakistan territorial dispute.

Chapter 2 analyzes a historical development of common identity called “Kashmiriyat” that transcended the individual’s religious and cultural identity of the Kashmir. It is a product of religious and ethnic encounter guided by the leadership of the philanthropist Kings of Kashmir.

Chapter 3 discusses the history of rifts in the identities of Kashmiri society until 1989. Social cohesion of the Kashmir was affected by territorial extension, the lack of leadership. Moreover, the emergence of Indian independence movement, dictatorship of the monarchy, and the dominance of majority community created a severe rift in the Kashmir society from the 1940’s to the 1980’s.

Chapter 4 analyzes the political, economic and social demand of the minority communities in conflicts. The current reality is that most minority community members in Leh are haunted either by actual or potential violence or by non-violent political dispute. This is partly because of the fact that the communities are politically divided on the cultural,

religious, and socio-political issues. The main issues are political autonomy, demographic change, preservation of the culture, radicalization of the communities, the presence of the domination in the access to power and resources by specific identity groups.

Chapter 5 deals with the analysis of the agents of the conflicts, how the non-violent social interactions among different stakeholders turned into the stage of violent conflict in the 1990's, and impact of conflict on the social capital in Ladakh. Based on the extensive field research, a dichotomous division perceived by people in the social differentiation of those who are "the innocent" and "the evil" through the process of manifesting alliance and isolation has been discussed. This research has found that while the isolation of Muslim communities by Buddhist reduced the informal social capital, the formal social capital grew in Leh with the Buddhist networking with Hindu organizations. The escalation of conflict into violence was driven by the governing system of Leh that provided the greater access of Kashmiri majority Sunni communities to political power and economic resources, and thus led to the de facto denial of those for Leh Buddhists proportionately.

Chapter 6 includes conclusion. Three points are clarified regarding identity politics in Leh 1) Both non-violent and violent conflicts in the region originated from struggles over political positions and socio-economic resources. These factors brought about dominance, fear, and rift among different communities and within one community. 2) People's consciousness about their identities that have been politically sensitized created divisions and thus polarized Leh's community. 3) Strong sense of religious and cultural identities in Leh that have been developed among the people were used to meet their political demand. This chapter also clarified a series of stages for the shift from non-violent to violent conflict: 1) socio-political and economic differentiation, 2) competition, 3) confrontation, 4) counteractions between and within the communities, 5) the absence of these characteristics (vacuum), and finally 6) violence. The above-mentioned points confirm the hypothesis of this thesis.

Finally, some limitation of this study and the prospect for the future study are discussed. The strength of this thesis is that the hypothesis is replicable to other protracted conflicts in the world.